

Cultural-Based Analysis in English Textbooks of Secondary Schools:
A Comparative Study of Sindh and Punjab Province



Nusrat Gul Bhellar*
Ali Raza Khoso
Musrat Gul Bhellar

MS Scholar, CELL, Mehran University of Engineering and Technology, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan at-
nusratgul94@gmail.com
Lecturer, CELL, Mehran University of Engineering and Technology, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan
PhD Scholar, CRP, Mehran University of Engineering and Technology, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan

Abstract

The current study compared two English textbooks about Sindh and Punjab and examined their cultural dimensions. This study's analysis of the English textbook applied a qualitative methodology. The data source for this research was the English textbooks for secondary schools entitled "Secondary Stage English Book One of 9th from the Sindh Textbook Board, and the other English Book of 9th from the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore." The reading material and exercises in both volumes served as the source of the data for the study. The instrument used for collecting the data was the researcher herself. The data was analyzed using the checklist presented by Byram et al. (1994) to highlight the cultural dimension of textbook evaluation. This study framework comprises an in-depth examination of every unit in both textbooks. In this research, eight cultural dimensions that are included in English textbooks were examined. The findings show that social contact, which is the second category on Byram's (1994) checklist and is more prevalent in the Sindh textbook than the other categories, is the dominant category, while in the Punjab textbook, the 1st category of Byram's (1994) checklist is a social identity and social group, which is more dominant than the other categories. Additionally, the outcome demonstrated the two textbooks' distinct variances. The textbooks share commonalities in terms of social identity and social group, national identity, belief and behavior, social and political institutions, socialization and life cycle, and stereotypes. Both textbooks undervalue national history. Textbooks varied greatly in the meantime; nevertheless, the main distinction is that national geography is covered in Sindh textbooks whereas it is not in Punjab textbooks.

Keywords: Cultural dimensions, Secondary schools, English textbook.

Introduction

Cultural competency is a crucial element of learning a foreign language since language and culture are interwoven and interdependent aspects of social existence. Languages are the most complete representations of a society's multifaceted cultures, hence teaching culture is regarded as a crucial part of learning a modern language. To understand the cultures of the countries, we

must first learn their languages. Culture shapes beliefs, transmits concepts, and disseminates information about traditions and morals. Language, which is an essential component of culture, is the means by which all of these qualities are expressed. Language and culture are inextricably linked and cannot be separated. Every lesson is about something, and that something is cultural (Harrison, 1990). Cortazzi and Jin (1999) suggested many methods for integrating appropriate cultural components into language textbooks. They consist of the source culture, the target culture, and the native culture. While "target culture" refers to the cultures of English-speaking nations or inner-circle countries (such as the cultures of the United States, Canada, Australia, the United Kingdom, and New Zealand), "source culture" refers to the native culture of the learners.

To clarify, textbooks function as a medium via which a particular community group can introduce its cultural material. (Gray, 2000). The cultures of the West and the East diverge greatly. Even if they are speaking the same language, their meanings are different. For example, when someone from the West says "dinner," they can mean pizza or hot dogs. In contrast, dinner in Eastern culture may particularly relate to rice. Stated differently, miscommunication arises when individuals fail to comprehend one another's cultural background (Tseng & Chao, 2012). There is a growing number of language educators emphasizing the important significance of culture in English textbooks because language and culture are inextricably linked. Textbooks are thought to be cultural objects with significant purposes. Textbooks are thought to be cultural objects that serve significant purposes. It can be viewed as a symbol for activities, culture, grammar, vocabulary, and language exercise. Books that have been authored and published are referred to as textbooks; they are resources for education. Among language learning resources, textbooks have undergone the greatest investigation. One of the things that helps students succeed in their language acquisition is textbooks. A textbook, in addition to the presence of an instructor with cultural expertise, is essential for language learners.

Textbooks can be useful resources for guiding teachers. Most textbooks will most likely provide a variety of activities, exercises, or projects that teachers might utilize to supplement their lessons (Arslan, 2016). When educators, students, and textbook authors have similar cultural values, then textbooks are helpful. Cultural representation in textbooks is a particularly delicate matter since even if people do not share the same cultural beliefs, they need at least be aware of one another's cultural conventions. Therefore, in endorsing or creating textbooks that are used to teach other languages and, by extension, foreign cultures, stakeholders and educators should exercise caution (Asghar & Sulaimani, 2017). English textbooks need to contain information on the target language's culture. (Wahyuni, Rizkanisa, Samad, & Daud, 2019). It is important to remember that more than only vocabulary and grammar standards are required when learning a language. Learning a language requires learning about the culture of the country you are speaking (Wahyuni et al., 2019). So textbooks are not only language samples; they are also "cultural goods" that need to be assessed to see if they are a useful tool for exposing students to other cultures and contain cultural materials that are pertinent to the intended audience (Jismulatif & Putri, 2023).

Several studies have been carried out by researchers to examine the cultural content of English textbooks used in Pakistan at different educational levels (see: Muhammad Tahir, 2012; Mahmood, Asghar, and Hussain, 2012; Dildar, Hassan, Ali, and Juni, 2015; Habib, 2014; Arshad, Shah, and Ahmad, 2020; Ghaffar, Sarwat, and Iqbal, 2023). Examining the use of English

textbooks is a fascinating topic. Even if a lot of research has been done on textbooks and their cultural components, there are still a lot of prospects for study because of the connection between culture and language. In order to fill the gap, the current study will look at how cultural content is included in the 9th-grade English textbooks used in secondary schools in Sindh and Punjab. So, there is a dearth of studies that examine cultural representation in the context of Pakistan using Byram et al. (1994) checklist on cultural content for textbook evaluation. This paper aims to analyze two textbooks used in the 9th grade of secondary schools in Sindh and Punjab to determine how diverse their representation of cultures is in both books.

Research Questions

The current study aims to determine:

Q.1 What are the dominant categories of cultural dimension based on the Byram (1994) checklist presented in 9th-grade English textbooks at secondary schools in Sindh and Punjab?

Q.2 How do the 9th-grade English textbooks of Sindh and Punjab differ from each other through cultural dimensions based on the Byram (1994) checklist?

Literature Review

English Textbooks

Specifically, textbooks serve as media that help educators organize their lessons (Ur, 1999). Teachers employ a wide variety of English textbooks, all of which highlight the source material (Wahyuni et al., 2019). Actually, the main thing this study focuses on the English textbooks for secondary schools entitled “Secondary Stage English Book One of 9th from the Sindh Textbook Board, and the other is English Book of 9th from the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore.”

In educational environments, textbooks can be seen as an authority or an ideology. Therefore, textbook production, design, and publication are seen as necessities to satisfy ideological, commercial, or even educational goals (Hosseinzadeh, Heidari, & Choubsaz, 2022). Textbooks are important resources for cultural representations that are widely researched and discussed by academics, course designers, and English language instructors. They also play important roles in ELT (Cunningsworth, 1995). For textbooks to be effective, two things must be present. Before using the phrase in any situation, it must be contextualized. Textbooks need to provide pertinent and relevant background knowledge to help learners effectively use language for communication. Secondly, the resources ought to recognize the importance of language form in addition to emphasizing language use. Thirdly, genuine materials are needed rather than ones that use fabricated or misleading wording. English textbooks in particular need to integrate cultural content. (Crawford, 1995).

Cultural Content in the English Textbooks

The amount of cultural information that is portrayed in English and ELT/EFL textbooks has been extensively studied in a wide range of publications. Both qualitative and quantitative methods were employed in some research (SHAHEEN, NOSHEEN, BASHIR, & ANJUM, 2018), whereas the other adopted qualitative and quantitative approach (Arshad, Shah, & Ahmad, 2020), and recently some studies introduced Qualitative content analysis to study the cultural content in English textbooks (Ghaffar, Sarwat, & Iqbal, 2023). However, not all research considers ELT and English textbook evaluation to be adequate sources of cultural content representation. (Yuen, 2011). English textbooks, according to a researchers, were biased towards certain cultures (Arshad et al., 2020). Using a checklist from Bank (2001), a study was

conducted to look into the local cultural components of the KBSM English language curriculum. The results showed that LI cultural aspects were not sufficiently incorporated, and they recommended that ELT textbooks incorporate content from the cultures of the learners (Zakaria & Hashim, 2009). An investigation into the cultural relevance of ELT textbooks used in secondary education in Hong Kong Results showed that US culture was portrayed in textbooks as being prominent, whereas African cultures were underrepresented (Yuen, 2011).

A study on how localization is preferred by language education planners in their macro-planning for language instruction, with a focus on how culture is represented in conversations and localized and reading passages in international textbooks used in Iran. A content analysis was performed using the categorizations suggested by Cortazzi and Jin as well as Adaskou, Britten, and Fahsi. The objective was to determine which "cultures"—those related to the first language, those related to the target language (TL), or other cultures—as well as the sociological and aesthetic aspects of each culture were covered in these textbooks. The results of the analysis showed that only a small percentage of the cultural aspects included in the localized textbooks were based on both the target language (TL) and other cultures, with the majority being culturally neutral and not referring to any specific culture (Tajeddin & Teimournezhad, 2015).

A study was undertaken on exploring cultural elements in two Turkish EFL books taught to 3rd and 4th grade students. The results showed that there is an imbalance in the items related to culture, meaning that the amount of things from native cultures is less than that of target and intercultural cultures (Arslan, 2016). This study uses content analysis to look into the cultural aspects of an English senior high school textbook in Indonesia that was released in 2017 by the Ministry of Education and Culture. The results showed that while the textbook has extensively included local culture in the form of the eight aspects, it also presents other cultures, including those of the target language and other countries, to foster intercultural communicative skills (Ariawan, 2020).

The 2013 textbook curriculum "When English Rings the Bells" was utilized by junior high school students in grade VII for a study on its cultural content, utilizing Byram's (1994) standards for textbook evaluation. Ten cultural categories were identified in the textbook, according to the findings. Geographical location, behavior, beliefs, and social identities and groups are the most rated cultural content categories. The majority of the cultural content that is shown is Indonesian. A tiny percentage is presented in the target culture. Regretfully, the textbook's writers neglected to include national history and global culture (Fahik, 2020).

This study, which is a content analysis, looks at the cultural components included in junior high school English textbooks. It also looks for signs of global cultural manifestation and the amount of attention paid to local culture. The information was gathered from the most recent editions of the textbooks for grades 7 and 8, "When English Rings a Bell," and 9 (Think Globally Act Locally). The data demonstrated that: (1) social group & social identity govern the cultural dimension, followed by belief & behavior. However, other aspects—such as national identity and stereotypes, social contact, the lifecycle and socialization, national geography, national history, and socio-political institutions—are not frequently discussed (Mandarani, Purwati, & Santoso, 2021).

The study investigates a topic that has not gotten much attention in ELT research worldwide: cultural representation in the reading sections of ELT textbooks in India. Using 10 ELT textbooks from four states, one national board from India, and a sequential mixed-method

design, the study intends to analyze the cultural representation of the textbook material, people ethnic, gender, and national characteristics, and the depth of the cultural content. Results showed that there are large regional differences in the overall dominance of British cultural representations, which include a large percentage of British, Irish, and generally White characters, a considerable degree of gender bias, and generally little in-depth cultural engagement (Bose & Gao, 2022).

The study of how culture is portrayed and how it is introduced to senior high school students learning English as a second language in Indonesian textbooks. The study methodically examines the cultural material and themes found in three Electronic English teaching textbooks: Bahasa Inggris X, Bahasa Inggris IX, and Bahasa Inggris XI revised edition (2017) by Kemdikbud RI. It does this by using a qualitative descriptive approach with an intercultural viewpoint. The study's conclusions show that while target culture and global culture are comparatively underrepresented, source culture content predominates (Jismulatif & Putri, 2023). The research on titled "When English Rings a Bell" 2017 edition. It is a junior high school textbook for the second grade that was released by the Ministry of Education and Culture in Indonesia. The researcher used a documentation technique to gather the data. Additionally, Miles and Huberman's data analysis procedures—which include data reduction, data display, and conclusion formulation and verification—were used to analyze the data. Additionally, the existence of two data analysts—the researcher and a validator—was utilized in the Analyst Triangulation method to validate the data. The results show that source culture is the predominant cultural type that the textbook portrays (ADI & Hutami, 2023).

The researcher discovered in the aforementioned literature that, to date, no study has been conducted on Sindh and Punjab's 9th-grade English textbooks in comparison to examine the cultural representation using the Byram (1994) model, which offers eight cultural dimensions. It is imperative that textbook evaluations be completed for this reason. Thus, this study intends to examine the comparative analysis of cultural representation in English textbooks for ninth graders in Sindh and Punjab.

Research Methodology

The focus of the study is on the analysis of cultural dimension in the "Secondary Stage English Book One of 9th from the Sindh Textbook Board, and the other is English Book of 9th from the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore." This research is qualified as qualitative research. This research uses thematic analysis to expose the results. Finding patterns or themes in qualitative data is known as thematic analysis (Clarke & Braun, 2017). A thematic analysis's objective is to find themes—that is, significant or intriguing patterns in the data—and then utilize those themes to discuss the research or make a point (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017). A very helpful method of carrying out this kind of theme analysis is provided by the six-phase guide (Clarke & Braun, 2017). Step 1: Become familiar with the data, Step 2: Generate initial codes, Step 3: Search for themes, Step 4: Review themes, Step 5: Define themes, Step 6: Write up.

Data collection source

The data for the current study has been taken from English textbooks for secondary schools entitled "Secondary Stage English Book One of 9th from the Sindh Textbook Board, and the other English Book of 9th from the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore." Both books were authored by distinct people. Written by Prof. Fatima Shahabuddin, Ms. Rahila Waqar, and Ms. Rehmat Ebrahim, the 9th-grade English textbook for Sindh province was

published in 2022/2023. While Ruhi Zaka Malik, Fatima Dar, and Zarqa Bashir wrote the Punjab province's ninth-grade English textbook, which was published in 2022–2023. English textbook of Sindh province contains 8 units, and Punjab province textbook contains 12 units. While each unit is broken down into several texts.

Through the use of Byram's (1994) checklist, which offers eight cultural aspects, this qualitative study explores cultural representation. Particularly, qualitative analysis was used in this research. Materials examine and comprehend the framework provided by Byram's checklist (1994) in order to survey the instructional materials found in the text. The model that is being provided examines the textbook's cultural dimensions (Byram, 1994). Here, researchers used the Byram (1994) checklist on textbook evaluation as a theoretical framework through which they analyzed the data from English textbooks. The researcher collects the data from textbooks through some steps, like reading the textbooks carefully; finding the words, and sentences from units that are categorized as cultural elements according to Byram; underlining those materials that are related to culture; and lastly, analyzing the collected data about culture from textbooks through the Byram (1994) checklist, which has eight categorizes. In addition to declaring that eight features focused on cultural content should be incorporated in textbooks, Byram (1994) concurs that more cultural data should be included in textbooks. These aspects are shown in the table below:

No	The Aspects of Cultural Content in the Textbook
1	Social identity and social group (social class, ethnic minority and majority, regional identity, professional identity, and an individual's social identities).
2	Social interaction (differing levels of formality; as outsider and insider).
3	Belief and behaviour (moral, religious beliefs; daily routines).
4	Social and political institutions (state institutions, health care, law and order, social security, local government).
5	Socialization and the life cycle (families, schools, employment, rites of passage).
6	National history (historical and contemporary events seen as markers of national identity).
7	National geography (geographical factors seen as being significant by members).
8	Stereotypes and national identity (what are 'typical' symbols of national stereotypes and artefacts recognized by the members).

Table 1. Eight Aspects for Analyzing the Content of Culture Findings

This research was a qualitative study to reveal the cultural dimensions in an English textbook of “Secondary Stage English Book One of 9th from the Sindh Textbook Board, and the other is English Book of 9th from the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore.” The researcher investigated the cultural aspect which are more frequently used in both textbook. The analysis of textbooks is divided into eight criteria. The researcher analyzed each textbook separately, then showed the dominant categories of both textbooks. In the end, the researcher compared both textbooks to show the similarities and differences between them. The study's findings are discussed below:

Social identity and social group

Social class, regional identity, national identity, professional identity, and personal identity based on gender are a part of this category. Social class i.e. upper and middle class have been shown in the Sindh textbook (p.53&105), while it is neglected in the Punjab textbook. Professional identity like doctor and teacher. The regional identity of Pakistan is focused on through the chapter ‘Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai, while it is absent in the Punjab textbook (p.25). Professional identity is depicted through teachers, soldiers, and doctors in both textbooks, some other professions lawyers, pilots, and builders are depicted in the Sindh textbook but not in the Punjab textbook. While farmers, writers, nurses, and drivers are depicted in the Punjab textbook but not in the Sindh textbook.

Social interaction

The oral communication norms of Pakistani society are illustrated through several interactional instances. There are conversations between teachers, friends, and family members. Interaction between teacher-student, between friends is mentioned in both textbooks, while interaction between family members is present in Sindh's textbook (p.206, 207, 209, 211, and 213) and absent in the Punjab textbook.

Belief and behaviour

Age group, moral belief, religious belief, sports, eating habits, dressing, greetings, language, currency, shopping, festivals, and gender behaviors fall under this category. Eating habits are depicted in the Sindh textbook, while they are neglected in the Punjab textbook. Religious belief is depicted in both textbooks. Moral belief is depicted in Sindh textbooks and absent in Punjab textbooks. Greetings have been shown in both textbooks. Sports, i.e., cricket and football, have been shown in both textbooks, while tennis is depicted in the Sindh textbook and absent in the Punjab textbook. While hockey is depicted in the Punjab textbook and absent in the Sindh textbook. The names of festivals are only depicted in Sindh's textbooks (p.52).

Social and political institutions

Healthcare, tourism, education, transportation, state institutions, and other non-governmental organizations come under this category. Healthcare has been shown in both textbooks. Tourism is depicted in both textbooks. In the Sindh textbook, tourism is depicted, i.e., groups of friends going to visit museums (p. 13), and Moen-jo-Daro, Shalimar Garden, Badshahi Mosque, and Minar Pakistan are also tourist places depicted in the Sindh textbook. While in the Punjab textbook tourism is depicted, i.e., the Ottoman Masjid, Byzantine Church, Hagia Sophia Masjid, Blue Masjid, and Sultan Ahmed Masjid, these places are tourist attractions and present in Turkey. This international culture is depicted in the Punjab textbook. In the Sindh textbook, only the name of the state institution (the NADRA office) is depicted.

Socialization and the life cycle

Socialization and the life cycle discuss about families, schools, employment, and rites of passage. Family life is shown in the book. Family life is depicted through different things, i.e., eating dinner and lunch together (p. 50–45). A family ritual is depicted through all family members having to gather on Sunday at the grandparents' house (p. 209). A family will be going to Karachi to attend the wedding festival (p. 213-214). While family life is neglected in Punjab textbooks, the book presents the school life of Pakistani children, who go on to give presentations in class at school about “the role of women in Pakistan's creation and development” (p. 131). School and education are depicted in both textbooks.

National geography

This aspect discusses the national geography that is presented in the textbook. The geography of Pakistan is depicted in the Sindh textbook, i.e., K2, Nanga Parbat, and Gudu barrage, which add to the category of Pakistan's geography. It is neglected in Punjabi textbooks.

Stereotypes and national identity

There are both stereotypes and national identities presented in the two books. Cultural names, i.e., Muslims, Hindu, and Western. Muslim and Western names are depicted in both textbooks, but Hindu names are only depicted in Sindh textbooks. Both male and female characters are depicted in both books. In the Sindh textbook, gender inequality is depicted through both male and female characters, i.e., gender inequality has been shown (p. 52), in which males have more preference than females (Jameel can go for education in the city, but Sara should stay here and help her mother) and (188) in which females have more preference than males (girls are more intelligent than boys). Stories on animals, in which animals are shown in male characters and not female characters (p.99). Muslim's last prophet (S.A.W.W.) has been shown as honest and a blessing for the whole world, as depicted in both textbooks in Unit 1. While the national identity of Pakistan is depicted in both textbooks, the similarity in both textbooks is that Quaid-e-Azam's character has been shown in both textbooks. While Allama Iqbal, Mohtarma Fatima Jinnah, Begum Rana Liaquat Ali Khan, Begum Jahan Ara Shahnawaz, Professor Anita Ghulam Ali, and Bilquis Bano Edhi are depicted only in the Sindh textbook and absent in the Punjab textbook.

Discussion

The purpose of the research was to look into English textbooks for 9th grade used in Sindh and Punjab. The qualitative analysis using Byram's (1994) checklist as a framework reveals that the dominant category in the Sindh textbook social interaction, is more dominant category in the textbook than the other categories, while in the Punjab textbook, social identity and social group, is more dominant than the other categories. Both books inculcate great reverence for the Muslim religion, national identity, behavior & beliefs, and social life of Pakistan. It has similarities to (Fahik, 2020), who looked into the material of culture of a 2013 textbook curriculum of junior high school called "When English Rings the Bells Used by Students in Grade VII." The study's objectives were based on Byram's approach, which divides the textbook's cultural content into eleven categories and examines each one. The findings about social identity and social group, behavior and belief, and location comprise the majority of assessed cultural content. The similarity in both textbooks is that national history is neglected in both books, while the difference is that national geography is present in the Sindh textbook and absent in the Punjab textbook. Other six categories are present in both textbooks this is the same but some material is different in these categories. The researcher deduces from the foregoing justification that there are no similarities between this study and any other research in the same field. The portrayal of the cultural elements results in an imbalanced proportion, whereby one component is highly represented while the other is not represented at all.

Conclusion

The English textbook has undergone numerous revisions; the current study looks into the most recent edition. The analysis of the textbook has demonstrated the cultural dimensions that are implied in the "Secondary Stage English Book One of 9th from the Sindh Textbook Board, and the other is English Book of 9th from the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore."

Byram et al. (1994) framework was used in this study's data analysis. They suggested eight elements that both textbooks must contain.

The result showed that in the 9th English textbook of Sindh province out of eight categories 2nd category of Byram's (1994) checklist is social interaction which is a more dominant category in the textbook than the other categories. While 3rd category is belief and behavior, 8th category is stereotypes and national identity, and 1st category is social identity and the social group also gets a good portion in the textbook. In the 9th English textbook of Punjab out of eight categories, 1st category of Byram's (1994) checklist is social identity and social group is more dominant than the other categories. The 8th category stereotypes and nations, the 3rd category, belief and behavior, and the 2nd category social interaction also get a good portion in the textbook. Out of the eight cultural materials listed in the Byram criteria, the ninth English textbook for Sindh only presents seven different types of cultural content. Social identity and social group, social interaction, belief and behavior, political and social institutions, socialization and the life cycle, national geography, stereotypes, and national identity are some examples of the different cultural dimensions.

According to Byram, of the eight cultural elements in the ninth English textbook for Punjab, only six are covered. Social identity and social group, social interaction, belief and behavior, political and social institutions, national identity, and stereotypes are some examples of the different cultural dimensions. So, many similarities and differences are present in those categories, which are present in both textbooks. Another similarity is that national history is neglected in both textbooks, while the difference is that national geography is present in the Sindh textbook and absent in the Punjab textbook. The researchers came to the additional conclusion that students will lack perspective when it comes to appreciating culture and its uniqueness on a global scale due to the imbalance of cultural dimensions in textbooks.

Recommendation

- By giving authors constructive criticism, English teachers can actively contribute to correcting the disparities in how cultural materials are represented.
- English needs to be studied as a skill rather than as a subject, similar to social studies, physics, and zoology.
- The researcher suggested that more investigation on the cultural elements in English textbooks to enhance students' language proficiency. To improve English textbooks, they pushed other scholars to investigate the significance of cultural resources within comparable or dissimilar theoretical frameworks.
- The purpose of this study is to offer more information sources for further investigation. Even future research may make a comparison between other English textbooks from primary and higher secondary English textbooks by using Byram's (1994) checklist on cultural dimensions for textbook evaluation.
- The researcher herself will conduct larger-scale research on the same topic for her Ph.D. degree.

References

- ADI, P. P., & Hutami, N. (2023). *CULTURAL CONTENT ANALYSIS OF AN ENGLISH TEXTBOOK "WHEN ENGLISH RINGS A BELL" USED FOR SECOND GRADE OF JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL (STUDENT'S BOOK)*. UIN RADEN MAS SAID.
- Ariawan, S. (2020). Investigating cultural dimensions in EFL textbook by using Byram checklist. *Register Journal*, 13(1), 123-152.

- Arshad, A., Shah, S. K., & Ahmad, M. (2020). Investigating cultural contents in English language teaching materials through textbook evaluation. *Journal of Language and Cultural Education*, 8(2), 127-145.
- Arslan, S. (2016). An analysis of two Turkish EFL books in terms of cultural aspects. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 232, 217-225.
- Asghar, J., & Sulaimani, A. (2017). EXPLORING CULTURAL REPRESENTATION IN ESL TEXTBOOKS IN PAKISTAN: A CRITICAL LINGUISTIC OVERVIEW.
- Bose, P., & Gao, X. (2022). Cultural representations in Indian English language teaching textbooks. *SAGE open*, 12(1), 21582440221082102.
- Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. *The journal of positive psychology*, 12(3), 297-298.
- Crawford, J. (1995). The role of materials in the language classroom: Finding the balance. *TESOL in Context*, 5(1), 25-33.
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing your coursebook*: Macmillan.
- Fahik, T. (2020). English textbook: A Culture-based analysis. *Lingua Scientia*, 27(1), 55-64.
- Ghaffar, R. A., Sarwat, S., & Iqbal, B. (2023). Cultural Promotion Through Language: A Case Study Of English Textbooks At Secondary Level In Different Provinces Of Pakistan. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 1861-1876.
- Gray, J. (2000). The ELT coursebook as cultural artefact: How teachers censor and adapt.
- Harrison, B. (1990). Culture and the language classroom. (*No Title*).
- Hosseinzadeh, M., Heidari, F., & Choubasaz, Y. (2022). A Comparative Analysis of the Cultural Contents and Elements in International and Localized ELT Textbooks. *International Journal of Society, Culture & Language*, 10(1), 109-124.
- Jismulatif, J., & Putri, S. A. (2023). The Culture Gap: An Analysis of Source, Target, and Global Culture Representation in Indonesian English Teaching Textbooks. *REiLA: Journal of Research and Innovation in Language*, 5(1), 89-98.
- Maguire, M., & Delahunt, B. (2017). Doing a thematic analysis: A practical, step-by-step guide for learning and teaching scholars. *All Ireland Journal of Higher Education*, 9(3).
- Mandarani, V., Purwati, O., & Santoso, D. R. (2021). A CDA Perspective of Cultural Contents in the English Junior High School Textbooks. *Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 5(2), 237-250.
- SHAHEEN, M., NOSHEEN, A., BASHIR, M., & ANJUM, S. (2018). Representation of Target Culture in Oxford Modern English Textbooks: Discourse Analysis. *European Academic Research*, 6(9), 5263-5283.
- Tajeddin, Z., & Teimournezhad, S. (2015). Exploring the hidden agenda in the representation of culture in international and localised ELT textbooks. *The Language Learning Journal*, 43(2), 180-193.
- Tseng, C.-J., & Chao, C.-T. (2012). Teaching culture in Taiwan's EFL classroom. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 47, 1843-1846.
- Ur, P. (1999). *A course in language teaching*.
- Wahyuni, Y. D., Rizkanisa, N., Samad, I. A., & Daud, B. (2019). Experiencing English: A textbook evaluation on the cultural loads. *Al-Ta lim Journal*, 26(3), 254-266.
- Yuen, K.-M. (2011). The representation of foreign cultures in English textbooks. *ELT journal*, 65(4), 458-466.

Zakaria, M., & Hashim, N. (2009). Local cultural aspects in the KBSM English language materials. *Universiti Teknologi Malaysia*.