

## Resolving Orientalists' Illogical Inquiries about Hadiths in a Logical Manner



Hafiz Tariq Hassan

Assistant Professor, GDC, Arakhel Tsd Darra Kohat/MS, Islamic Studies Scholar, Riphah International University, Islamabad athassanqureshi2081@gmail.com

#### **Abstract**

This article endeavors to provide a solution to the problem of Orientalist opuses which challenge the Hadith compilation accuracy in the field of Islamic scholarship. Orientalism is a term used by western scholars to describe various works they have produced over different periods of time which depict Islam and its traditions solely from a colonial perspective. The central theme of this article revolves around the naturalness of some people's arguments of convenience among Orientalists that does clearly invalidate Hadith, the encapsulation of the traditions linked to the Prophet Muhammad. The author of this article takes the logic of the reasoning pathway, aiming to deny and show the truth of criticisms by the use of a deeper and precise understanding of Hadith scholarship. It analyses the Orientalist arguments typically cited, like taking the late compilation period of Hadith or complicatedness of narrations attributed to the potential of political bias. In conclusion, article clearly positions the backdrop of Islamic congregations against the presented counter-arguments. This authenticity criterion is the object of this study. It is worth noting that he explains in detail the scientific approach of authentic hadith's transmission. It is pointed out that the right understanding of Hadith requires the person to know historical context and the Hadith collections that are compiled are consistently in internal manner. Humanize: Through taking their arguments into consideration with some sense of logicalness, the issue tries to demonstrate the source of Islamic information from Hadith. It reaffirms the relevance of studying attacks as those based on constructive criticism and those stemming from illogical actions towards Islam. By the end, this method opens up the Hadith's mysteries for us and reveals its significance in Islamic scholarship.

Keywords: Orientalist Critiques, Hadith Authenticity, Logical Manner, Islamic Traditions

#### Introduction

The Hadith, the collection of the sayings, actions and sign of approval which are reported by Prophet Muhammad, jointly with the Quran constitute the basis of Islamic jurisprudence and theology. Besides being the main source of information for Muslims, the Quran also draws upon the Hadith, which gives practical examples and interpretations of the Quranic teachings. Through



the hadiths, we learn that the prophet lived a life of intelligence, constant contemplation and observance unto which the Muslims seek to look up to. Faithfully, the Quran and Hadith makes up the two main texts of the sharia law and ethics, keeping the belief and customs of Muslims with Islamic laws round the world.

Hadith is one of the most significant sources in Islam. This fact was well-known since the dawn of Islam. As stated by the scholars e.g. Jonathan Brown, Hadith study is an important step in the process of understanding the history in which the Quranic verses where revealed and in practicing their main idea and in everyday life (Brown, 2011). Hadiths are not only needed for the application of the same, for the interpretation of those verses in the Quran that have less clarity, but also for explaining details that are not mentioned in the Quran, such as ritual practices, social mannerisms, and legal rulings. For example, the Quran gives the optic "to pray" but the Hadith clarifies how to carry out this prayer procedure. Other than this, there are hadiths that shed light upon the behavior and personality of our Prophet. These qualities serve as a guide or role model for the believers. The systematic knowledge that is founded on the Quran and Hadith brings to life the way Islamic law, morals and spiritual principles are interpreted within the religion.

Orientalism is a term that Western academics use for the study of the Orient, especially the Middle East and Asiatic nations. Elucidated by Edward Said, Orientalism surfaced during the 17th century, which was the colonial period wherein European powers tried to know and regulate societies that were out of the Western sphere of influence. Orientalist scholars quite often encountered their Muslim sources laden with these preconceived biases and sterotypes, viewing them through the Eurocentric lens and rhetoric that this ["Islam" and pale adherents] was exotic, backward or even inferior. This, therefore, gave rise to misprints and misrepresentations of Quranic texts and cultures, which contributed to the sprouting of stereotypes and played up hierarchical systems of power (Said, 1978). One such Orientalist scholar even portrayed Islam as innately violent or suppressive, owing to a selective reading of Islamic texts and the occurrence of historical events that never let them look beyond. In short, a lot of the Orientalist mores of the East depicted the Orient as something erotic and romantic, alienating as beautiful and primitive compared to the modernity and conceptuality of the West.

The goal of the article is to expose and rebut some of the illogical and wrong objections of the hadith that orientalist scholars made. Typically, these criticisms spring from the Orientalist attitudes and adulterations happening to the Islamic book, the Qur'an, provoking ignorance about the Hadith and Islam in general. Through the analysis of what the article explains to be some of the misunderstandings about the Hadith and the importance of it in Islamic tradition, the article aims to provide a more elaborate explanation of what Hadith is and what role does it play in the overall Islamic tradition, against the narratives of the orientalists which disputes the legitimacy of Islamic beliefs and practices. Through logical analysis and evidence-based arguments, the writer will endeavor to break Islam's portrayal by the Orientals and contribute to a more truthful and balanced view of the same. In this regard, it aides fully in the comprehensive liberation of Islamic studies and the development of a cross-cultural community.



## Common Orientalist Criticisms of Hadith

Orientalists offer their version of Hadith evaluation which almost undermines the authenticity of Hadith. The existence of the last Hadith collections is sponsored by the one who contests the late compilation and which, purportedly, was made long after Muhammad's time, the prophet. Delays caused, they say, provide a possibility of untruths or distortion creeping into the exchanged material. The oral replication of sayings of Hadith by Seerah (a chain narration traced over several generations) and recorded in writing afterwards could have allowed for accidental occurrences or even fabrication of the materials (Crone, 2004). Secondly, orientalists recount that this Orientalism may give a hand to the motivations of politics or the sectarian programs of compiling the Hadith collections. They note that the jurisdiction of the narrators perhaps may have influenced choices about including or excluding certain hadiths, Humanize:

The criticism goes with the authenticity criteria which the scholars of Hadith also used to validate the chain of transmission (isnad). As for Orientalists, they believe that the strict thresholds elaborated by scholars of Islam in studying the narrators' credibility and reliability might not be enough to ensure the Islamists of the traditions' accuracy (Brown, 2007). Apart from this scholars also mention the obvious contradictions or misconceptions in the hadith works, these define the trustiness of the hadith collections and sometimes misunderstood as possible fabrication or alteration (Robinson, 2003). Consistently, the criticism is directed to the incorporation of weak, doubtful or dubious narrations in some Hadith collections. The Orientalists i.e., those who research European and Middle Eastern cultures, are of the opinion that if the Hadith corpus loses its credibility due to the uncritical acceptance of weak Hadiths; then overall credibility of the Hadith corpus will be shaken (Cook, 2000). In addition, some Orientalist scholars are against the accuracy of the Hadiths that take place in months and years that are not known or spirit not in a way that is in line with the known historical events and conditions. They claim that the absence of independent reports provided by other historical sources raise doubts regarding the credibility of these accounts. Rashid al-Din (2009) has been another author who has criticized the Quran's historical accuracy. In general, these claims refute either the autography or the reliability of The Prophet Muhammad's words, and hence bring about a new discussion regarding the sources of Islam and the way The Prophet Muhammad is portrayed in such literature.

# Logical Negations to Orientalist Criticisms

## Late Compilation

However, the orientalist scholars, on the basis of the later compilations of hadith collections, presume that the authenticity of all the collections is doubtful. With this claim, the Islamic scholars offer very clear and credible reasons. Hadith science, as advanced by Muslim scholars, is based upon well-defined standards of transmission of which the traditions are certified with regard to their correctness. Concerning Hadith, the scholars of the transmition chain (isnad) and the report text (matn) scrutintrically examined each narration, making sure that only relevant reports entered canonical collections. Next, memorization (hifz) among the earlier Muslims acted



as the ultimate safeguard of these Hadiths before they had been fully committed to the pages of books. The Quran itself acknowledges the reliability of oral transmission, stating, "Indeed, it is We who sent down the Qur'an and indeed, We will be its guardian" (Quran 15:9). This Almighty pledge apart from the Quran gave special attention to the homes of the honest sayings of the Prophet including the Hadiths.

## Possibility of Political Bias

Muslim theologians do not consider such criticism as claiming bias in the Hadith collections by implying that these Hadith were collected by poorly educated or prejudiced people. Whilst the acknowledgment that political influences were seen during the early Islamic period is considered, Hadith scholars have always been adroit in verifying the soundness of narrations. The meticulous standards of Hadith compiling, such as the veracity of narrators and the conformity with the transmission chains, were among the measures designed to ensure the authenticity of the Hadith corpus as a whole. Moreover, the Quran warns against distorting the truth for personal or political gain, stating, "O you who have believed, if there comes to you a disobedient one with information, investigate, lest you harm a people out of ignorance and become, over what you have done, regretful" (Quran 49:6).

## Lack of Chain of Transmission Criteria

Critics often question authenticity of chain of transmission (isnad) one tends to use in Hadith authentication. But Islamic science rejects this type of thinking method by providing comprehensive evidence of the justification. The Hadith scholars unfailingly and carefully examined the narrators in the tradition of the Prophet, taking into account their character, ability to remember and whether they last accounted for loyalty to Muslim beliefs. Not only narrators of questionable character or weak memory, but also narrators who entered the chain unreliably, got rejected; hence, in this way the authenticity of the transmitted traditions was ensured. Such system of teaching is based on the words of the Prophet Mohammad who was not just the founder of the religion but also the guide who told his companions to deliver his messages precisely. The Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him) said, "Send my message, even if it is only one verse" (Sahih al-Bukhari). Indeed, the stringent requirement of meticulous preservation of the Hadiths is an essential element of the chain of transmission criteria that guarantees the authenticity and reliability of any Hadith.

### Contradictions and Inconsistencies

Scholars of Islam are in a position to address seeming contradictions or inconsistencies in Hadith literature in a variety of ways, including putting these reports in context and considering the different circumstances in which they were reported. Besides the obvious fact that hadiths were spoken at different times and settings and for different purposes, there were also variations in the wordings and emphases of the messages being circulated. Nevertheless, these modifications do not necessarily mean that humans bent or rearranged the facts. Moreover, the scholars are of view that the presence of plural narrations on the specific topic adds to the reliability of corpus or complete works because it extends or broadens the view of the prophet's narratives so that we can have a wider view of the Prophet's enunciations. The Quran encourages critical thinking and



reflection, stating, "Do they not reflect upon the Qur'an, or are there locks upon [their] hearts" (Quran 47:24). As for this commandment, it underlines the necessity of reasoning and resolving different positions one might find in the Hadith literature and the Quran.

### Reliance on Weak Narrations

Critics sometimes cite the problem of weak or unreliable narrations incorporation in Hadith compilations. Nevertheless, Muslim scholars, being careful about the issue, examined the weak narrations very thoroughly and brought their weaknesses to the light. And thus anyone could evaluate their strength to offer certainties. The direct logical propositions statements were the most critical when establishing the laws and beliefs as they can be supported with other stronger evidences. Furthermore, in presence of a poor account, does not imply for the whole Hadith literature that it is not credible because scholars who used critical methods decided to remove those that could not be trusted. The Prophet Muhammad himself advised against the dissemination of false information as he declared, "Whoever intentionally makes a lying statement against me should take his place in Hell" (Sahih al-Bukhari). Such parts indicate a stand of no compromise against the false narratives where the credibility of the hadith transmission is concerned.

### External Historical Evidence

Muslim jurists deal with the skeptical criticism that may arise due to the fact the emplacement or authenticity of certain Hadith may not be accurately pinpointed in time by incorporating the complex nature of history as well as the weakness of merely relying on external evidence available. While adding further evidences from other historical sources may help to draw a more accurate picture, it is often not available or is still not clearly documented. Hadith documents This part of the canon brought information spectrum about lifestyle and the Prophet Muhammad that are not reported in the historical archives. Though this improves the credibility of the scholarly traditions that created the Hadiths by virtue of the criteria developed by the Hadith scholars to verify the accuracy of the transmitted traditions, this does not in itself invalidate the authenticity claims to the Hadiths. Moreover, the Quran emphasizes the importance of learning from the Prophet's example, stating, "There has certainly been for you in the Messenger of Allah an excellent pattern for anyone whose hope is in Allah and the Last Day and [who] remembers Allah often" (Quran 33:21. With these words, Aisha not only emphasizes the importance of School as the source of guidance for the Muslims, but also beyond the presence of historical facts, which pose a real threat to the whole system.

## Importance of Understanding Hadith Context

It is important to have a clear picture of the history and culture of the period when hadith narration was carried out in order to take influential and accurate interpretation and evaluation of these sources. The hadith literature, in the main, deals with a number of teachings, sayings, and actions of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) that were transmitted orally and assembled later into composite books. These traditions are social, political and cultural themselves which influenced the early Islamic society. The eternal truths of the Hadith cannot see the light without lives contextual, and therefore one cannot accurately understand and interpret them. Historical and



cultural themes may create the misconception about Hadith. This can result in incorrect criticism that is not logical. Correspondingly, some Orientalist scholars may be inclined to castigate particular Hadiths as harsh or inflexible, without a possible justification given the specific narrating context. A hadith that has not been understood in due context could lead mishap to the right inferences made regarding its applicability and relevance to contemporary times. For an example, Orientalist critics may argue by pointing to several Hadiths that openly support severe punishments in Islamic law for Muslims who are accused of adultery or theft, like stoning and amputation, claiming that this is Islam's real nature and barbaric or without any compassion. Nevertheless, a closer analysis of their historical setting points out that such kind of penalty was used only in certain situations and it was aimed at deterring severe offences by using inflicting of the punishment which was the only one tool in the hands of the society in those times. Moreover, Islamic law conditions the setup of these materials with many criteria like two witnesses and taking into tolerance.

#### Conclusion

Hadith, being a key in Islamic learning, offers very clear and beneficial lessons and views of the Prophet Muhammad's teachings and behavior. Together with the Quran, it constitutes the foundation of Islamic jurisprudence, ethics, and spirituality; it is the book that informs the creed and daily worship of Muslims all over the world. Because the significance of realizing the context in which Hadith was narrated cannot be underestimated, this should play a critical role while evaluating and classifying different traditions. This contextual understanding is of extreme importance for Hadith interpretation in the meanwhile forbidding the emergence of wrong views resulting from ignoring the circumstances in which they were transmitted. During our discourse, we focused on separating and rejecting the positive Orientalist theories through logic and evidences in the Islamic scholarly literature. Through refuting discussions on lateness of compilation, political bias, and even erroneousness within the chain of reports, we have presented a sortie to the faithfulness of textual analysis and a serious study of the Hadiths.

The preceding arguments are the evidence to show that Islamic scholars have such a depth of tradition and the rigour of methodology, whereby they conserve in the name of the prophet the integrity of his teachings. Besides, discursive judgement deemed valid in Islamic scholarship cannot be interchanged with spurious refutation given for only the sake of the latter. Positive criticism provide spiritual growth and help the believers become more active in reading the religious books whereas unreasonable harsh comments usually have their origin in personal bias or lack of understanding. In the course of interacting with Orientalist critiques in the ways of calmness and thoughtfulness, Muslim scholars will, hopefully, enrich their Hadith encyclopedia and be part of the evolution on Islamic sources and interpretations dishes. Finally, the rightly exemplified Hadith are integral to Muslims who strive to act with understanding and appreciation in their religious as well as mundane affairs. By studying and imploring Hadith within various contexts and times, we can continue to perceive it as a contributor to Islamic knowledge. In this manner, we may disinfect the haze of complexity surrounding Islamic religious studies.



of the Sunni Hadith Canon. Brill, 2007.

ISSN Online: 2709-6076 ISSN Print: 2709-6068

### References

Brown, Jonathan A.C. Hadith: Muhammad's Legacy in the Medieval and Modern World. Oneworld Publications, 2009.

Brown, Jonathan A.C. Muhammad: A Very Short Introduction. Oxford University Press, 2011. Brown, Jonathan A.C. The Canonization of al-Bukhari and Muslim: The Formation and Function

Cook, Michael. The Koran: A Very Short Introduction. Oxford University Press, 2000.

Crone, Patricia. Medieval Islamic Political Thought. Edinburgh University Press, 2004.

Hallaq, Wael B. An Introduction to Islamic Law. Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Quran

Robinson, Chase F. Islamic Historiography. Cambridge University Press, 2003.

Sahih al-Bukhari

Said, Edward. Orientalism. Vintage Books, 1978.

Schacht, Joseph. The Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence. Oxford University Press, 1950.