



## "Patriarchal Trends in the Pakistani Bride and House Without Windows; Comparative Analysis"

Fariah Bilal

Mr. Shahzad Hassan

Nabeela Gul

Mphil English from Qurtaba University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar at- [fariahbilal14@gmail.com](mailto:fariahbilal14@gmail.com)

MPhil Scholar at University of Malakand/ English Instructor at FAST National University of Computer and Emerging Sciences, Peshawar Campus at- [shahzad.hassan@nu.edu.pk](mailto:shahzad.hassan@nu.edu.pk)/  
[hassanshazad321@gmail.com](mailto:hassanshazad321@gmail.com)

Lecturer in English Department of English (Linguistics & Literature) Qurtaba University of Science & Information Technology Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan at- [Gulnabila353@gmail.com](mailto:Gulnabila353@gmail.com)

**Citation:** Fariah Bilal, Mr. Shahzad Hassan, & Nabeela Gul. (2024). Patriarchal Trends in the Pakistani Bride and House without Windows; Comparative Analysis. *Al-Qirtas*, 3(3). Retrieved from <https://al-qirtas.com/index.php/Al-Qirtas/article/view/346>

### *Abstract:*

*This research focuses on the exploration of patriarchal trends in the selected novels: Bapsi Sidhwa's The Pakistani Bride and Nadia Hashimi's A House Without Windows. Through a qualitative research method, the study examines the ways in which patriarchy manifests and affects female protagonists. The data is collected through close reading method of the novel. The study employed Spivak's concept as a theoretical framework. The findings highlighted the diverse forms of patriarchal oppression, ranging from physical violence to involve societal constraints. Women's value was found to be often contingent upon external validations, leading to their commodification and reduced autonomy. Furthermore, language emerged as a potent tool, capable of both suppression and empowerment. Family structures, in both the novels stood out as significant patriarchal agents, emphasizing the role of kinship ties in perpetuating gendered norms. Despite these challenges, an undercurrent of resilience was evident, highlighting the indomitable spirit of women continually resisting these constraints. Recommendations for future scholars encompass a varied approach, suggesting inquiries into secondary characters, socio-cultural contexts, cross-cultural comparisons and the role of narrative techniques in amplifying or mitigating the novels' patriarchal themes.*



## Introduction

### Overview

This chapter presents an introduction to feminist theory and patriarchal structures, articulated via diverse academic viewpoints. Additionally, it talks about the overviews of literary works i.e., *The Pakistani Bride* and *House Without Windows*. The chapter also lays out issues for investigation, aims of the research, pertinent questions, and the impact and limitations inherent in this scholarly pursuit. Furthermore, this chapter furnishes a comprehensive backdrop for the research topic under scrutiny.

### Introduction

Feminism, according to Brunell and Burkett (2023), is a broad spectrum of ideologies, social movements, and political movements with the same objective of defining, establishing, and achieving political, economic, personal, and social equality of the sexes. While feminist ideology has worldwide variants and expressions, it mostly arises in reaction to Western traditions that limit women's rights. Feminism is crucial for all people, regardless of gender, caste, or religion. Feminism promotes women's fairness and equality in all aspects of life and gives women the same chances and access to resources that men do.

Feminism includes a wide range of topics, including the history of women's oppression and potential ways for women to overcome their fear of authorship by creating their literary canon. Because there are so many psychological and cultural conceptions of femininity, feminism is a serious endeavour to analyse, explain, and grasp. According to feminism, women in these countries are treated unfairly from the perspective of males. Feminists have fought and still fight for women's rights, including equal pay, the right to own property, the right to vote, the right to work, the right to run for office, and the right to marriage and motherhood. Especially in the West where they are credited with attaining the suffrage movement and gender-neutral terminology in the property sector, many academics believed that the feminist movement was the driving force behind the significant historical developments that changed the rights of women. Some feminists say that including men's emancipation is within their goal since they feel that males are hurt by the conventional laws of gender. Feminists are primarily focused on women's rights. To comprehend the nature of gender inequality, feminist theory, which was



born out of the feminist movement, looks at the social roles and experiences that women have in their daily lives. The teddies were created by feminists in some fields to address gender-related concerns. If we look at history, we will see that feminism granted women the right to vote and many other rights and this will put an end to the life-changing effects it has on everyone's life, particularly on women. One of the first movements in human history is feminism. There are several varieties of feminism, but rather than defining them separately, feminism may be broken down into waves, and there are four waves of feminism.

The first wave of feminism, which emerged in the late 19th century, was not the first to express feminist ideas but rather the first genuine political movement in the Western world. The first wave's leaders emphasised the suffrage movement and the right to an education, with the simple objective of getting society to acknowledge that women are not men's property but rather human beings. In the second wave, women should be granted social and cultural rights and be freed from patriarchal society's tyranny. The third wave dealt with freedom of speech; racial disparities and women's reproductive rights were also stressed in this wave. The feminist movement has entered a new era known as the fourth wave of feminism as a result of the development of the internet and social media. It prompted women to use social media channels to speak out against the concerns.

According to Mahmood (2018), Pakistan is a country that rejects the idea of feminism while using the excuse of religion to discredit the true motivations of the feminist movement, which fights for equal rights. There are many reasons to be proud of Pakistan, not the least of which are the outstanding accomplishments of Pakistani women like Malala Yousafzai, Muniba Mazari, and Fiza Farhan. We all belong to a country that rejects the feminist idea while using the card of religion to distort the true intent of the struggle for equality. In Pakistan, women have made enormous strides in recent years. In Pakistan, the term "feminism" refers to a collection of groups that seek to define and establish the rights of women. These will strive for political, economic, and social rights and equality.

### **Patriarchy**

Patriarchy as a social construct refers to a system where males hold primary power and authority over women and children in the spheres of family, governance and various institutions



(Checkland, 2023). In this system, roles and resources are distributed unevenly that leads to male-dominated leadership, economic disparity and social influence. Although the term often sparks associations with male individuals, it is important to recognize that patriarchy represents a structural issue rather than just matter of individual behavior.

Such a system is self-perpetuating that is reinforced by cultural narratives, educational content and societal norms. While laws might exist that advocate for gender equality, informal mechanisms underpinning patriarchy pose barriers to real progress. From career opportunities to domestic responsibilities, this hierarchy shapes options available to individuals and limiting women to lesser roles and opportunities. Patriarchy extends far beyond legal structures and penetrates ideologies that form the bedrock of social interactions (Facio, 2013). Drawing upon a plethora of scholarly viewpoints discussion about patriarchy aims to present a multidimensional perspective.

Various scholars have conducted research studies on patriarchy. Zulfiqar (2022) concentrates primarily on how patriarchy intersects with property rights in Pakistan. He employs the terms "inequality regimes" and "patriarchal connectivity" to elucidate how women's access to resources like land remains elusive. His argument suggests that women's struggle for land ownership does not exist in isolation. Rather it is an issue enmeshed in legal, social and economic fabric. Moreover, shift the focus a bit there is another view regarding patriarchy. Coward (2022) opined that material resources more intangible in terms of patriarchy i.e., sexuality and social relationships. His research posits that in many societies patriarchy is manifested itself in norms governing sexual conduct. He argues that women find themselves entrapped within these socially constructed norms, which invariably perpetuate male dominance.

Rakow (2022) provides another point by investigating how popular culture reinforces patriarchal norms. It is not simply a matter of passive consumption; the media actively perpetuates these norms. Her research highlights that the mainstream often subjugates women to secondary roles, effectively strengthening patriarchal structures. This focus on popular culture offers a critical avenue for understanding how deeply entrenched patriarchy can be, beyond legal and social strictures. In the same strain. Gruenbaum, Earp and Shweder (2023)



introduce a stance on the role of patriarchy in maintaining female genital modifications. Contradicting conventional wisdom their findings propose that attributing such practices solely to patriarchal norms are simplistic. Instead, they urge to consider an array of factors, some possibly independent of patriarchal influence. This perspective serves as a reminder that while patriarchy assumes the role of a villain, the reality require a clear understanding.

Each scholar adds a distinctive aspect on discussion regarding patriarchy. One scholar links it to entrenched societal structures in Pakistan that deny women property rights. Another shifts the paradigm to focus on the more intangible yet far-reaching realms of sexuality and relationships. Rakow (2022) brings the discourse into the living rooms of common households by emphasizing the role of popular culture. Gruenbaum, Earp and Shweder (2023) complicate matters further by suggesting that patriarchal influence might not be as ubiquitous as commonly thought. This collection of perspectives not only broadens the field of view but also enriches discourse. Patriarchy as viewed through these scholars' works, extends its tentacles into diverse areas of life. However, it remains subject to varying degrees of influence and manifests itself in different ways, depending on the context. Thus, an effective struggle against patriarchal systems would require multi-pronged strategies that take these complexities into account.

## Bapsi Sidhwa

Bapsi Sidhwa is one of the well-known Pakistani American novelists. Her five novels *the cracking India*, *The Pakistani Bride*, *the crow eaters*, *Water and an American Brat* have been translated and published in several languages. Bapsi Sidhwa was born in 1938. She has always been very active in doing social work showing endless concern for the woman around her. All of her four novels reflect the personal experiences of the Indian subcontinent partitions and abuse against women. She begins her writing career at the age of 26.

## The Pakistani Bride

Bapsi Sidhwa, the author of *The Pakistani Bride*, takes you on an emotional trip into a tribal region of Pakistan that you won't soon forget. In *The Pakistani Bride*, a little girl called Zaitoon has many highs and lows. At an early age, she loses her parents as a result of the partition of India and Pakistan. Later that day, Zaitoon was adopted by a man by the name of Qasim. Qasim





saw the whole event, and at that time, he also lost several loved ones, including his wife and kid. Following that occurrence, Marium and Nikka and Qasim and Zaitoon begin sharing a home in Lahore. As Zaitoon got older, Qasim committed to marrying her off to his nephew from one of the tribes. She refused, but as Qasim was a man of his word, he didn't back down from his pledge and instead opted to take Zaitoon to his tribe to marry her. They encounter several individuals along the way who also assisted them in getting to their objective. Because Zaitoon was raised in the city and her cousin comes from a low-income household, she does not want to live in that tribal region or spend the rest of her life there. She also does not want to be married there.

After Zaitoon gets married, Qasim abandons her and returns to Lahore while oblivious to all of her sobs. Zaitoon's husband was just a few years older than her, but because of the male-dominated culture and the pressure from his family, he mistreated his wife. As a result of this shift in the atmosphere and the attitudes of the people, she chose to go. The lady from their tribe fled when the whole tribe began searching for her so they could murder her in front of everyone for the sake of their pride and to make an example because their egos wouldn't let them. The ending brought tears to everyone's eyes because we knew that Zaitoon was growing up all pampered like a flower and will end up leaving a nightmare and causing her father would know that was a help for her but still, he didn't support her. She is eventually rescued by Major Mushtaq who fixed her death by telling everyone that she died he buried her and takes her to Lahore to start a new life for her without the horrible memories of her past.

## **Nadia Hashmi**

Is a paediatrician, a novelist and a politician. She draws Afghan culture to internationally craft bestselling books for the readers. She wrote three international bestselling novels *The Pearl That Broke its Shell*, *When the Moon is Low* and *A House Without Windows*.

## **House Without Windows**

This novel is published in 2016. Zeba who was the protagonist character and she faced oppression from men in various forms from her brother, father and from her husband who was physically abusive and always tries to control her. Her father and husband also hold traditional views about women and they are more concerned with protecting the family's honour than



seeking justice. When Zeba was accused of murdering her husband and was sent to prison in Afghanistan. In prison she forms friendship with other women who were also there, together they navigate hard conditions and injustices in the system. “House without Windows” this title refers to the oppressive nature of human society, where woman’s are often restricted to their houses and didn’t allow them to fully participate in society. She owns a house that is described as being without windows which symbolizes the lack of acceptance in her life. Throughout the novel, the other woman and Zeba face lots of challenges which include discrimination, abuse and corruption. But besides these hurdles, they find a way to support each other and maintain hope for a better future. The title offers powerful commentary on the treatment of women in Afghan culture / Afghanistan and their struggles for justice in a society that often seems stacked against them. It is a thought-provoking novel that sheds light on the experiences of women in complex parts of the world.

### **The Statement of the Problem**

This research work revolves around Zaitoon and Zeba who are the protagonist of the selected novels and are portrayed as oppressed in the patriarchal society. They all face violence in their marriages they are portray as oppressed and are not allowed the right to education and to choose their partners. Are they oppressed and this is the argument why it is so and do they negotiate or adjust? In the novels, women are portray that they are suffering from oppression and suppression in the selected novels.

### **Research Objectives**

- 1) To investigate the patriarchal trends highlighted in the selected novels.
- 2) To identify the reaction of the protagonists to the patriarchal oppression in the selected novels.
- 3) To analyze the convergences and divergences of the patriarchal trends in the selected novels.

### **1.4 Research Questions**

- 1) What are the patriarchal trends highlighted in the selected novels?
- 2) How do the protagonists react to the patriarchal oppression in the selected novels?
- 3) What are the convergences and divergences in the patriarchal trends of the selected novels?



### Rationale of the Study

This rationale behind this study lies in addressing a noticeable research gap that, to date, remains unexplored the comparative analysis of the two novels, *The Pakistani Bride* and *House Without Windows*. Despite both texts bearing significant implications for feminist discourse and carry elements of patriarchal trends, no comprehensive comparative study has been conducted. This research study attempts to bridge this critical gap by dealing a detailed examination of these works, and illuminates the distinct and shared elements of patriarchal structures in their respective contexts. By undertaking this comparative analysis, the study aspires to provide a fresh perspective on patriarchal trends, convergences and divergences of the patriarchal trends and resistance in the works of Bapsi Sidhwa and Nadia Hashimi, thus contributing significantly to the discourse on patriarchy in literature and offering a unique lens through which these narratives can be comprehended.

### Significance of the Study

The research is significant in Asia because it highlights the pathetic and difficult lives of women. The violation of women by the patriarchal society that what are the issues that the protagonist character of the novel *The Pakistani Bride* and *House Without Windows* are facing. This study is necessary to indicate the patriarchal oppression that is highlighted in the selected novels and what are the reactions of Zaitoon and Zeba in the novel and to present the cultural contains that are indicated. The present research is significant to showcase the difficult life of women which is essential to attract the attention of people towards the agonized life of women in a patriarchal society.

Furthermore, the significance of this study is multidimensional and extends beyond the examination of two literary works. It contributes to the field of comparative literature by offering a juxtaposition of the selected works. This comparative analysis uncovers the portrayal of patriarchal trends and enriches the understanding of how diverse cultural and societal contexts shape the representation of gender dynamics in literature. In order to deal the distinctive approaches employed by Sidhwa and Hashimi regarding patriarchal issues, this study indicates the importance of recognizing these works as essential contributions to feminist literature.





Moreover, the significance extends to the broader feminist discourse, as this research brings attention to the pervasive issue of patriarchy in South Asian literature. Through the analysis of patriarchal strains and resistance depicted in these novels, it offers knowledge about the ways in which patriarchal norms persist and impact the lives of women in these societies. To examine patriarchy in these literary contexts, this study contributes to the comprehension of the challenges faced by women and the potential avenues for empowerment, resonating with broader discussions on gender equality and social justice.

### Delimitations of the Study

In this research study, the researcher confines the scope primarily to a comparative textual examination of two particular works: *The Pakistani Bride* and *House Without Windows*. The focus stays rigorously on the text rather than the broader feminist or post-colonial critiques that could be applied. Moreover, the chronological span under consideration remains circumscribed; this analysis not only venture into the texts' impact on society over multiple decades. Moreover, the study is not concerned with other works of the selected authors.

### Organization of the Study

This study is covered in five chapters:

Introduction

Literature Review

Methodology

Data Analysis

Conclusion and Recommendations

### Summary

The introductory chapter of this study established foundational elements of both feminism and patriarchal frameworks, explicated through a broad spectrum of academic voices. This chapter notably dissected summaries of two selected novels. It further delineated research problem, objectives, specific queries, and both the potential impact and constraints of the study at hand. This chapter served to equip readers with a thorough contextual landscape for the forthcoming analyses. In the next chapter i.e., literature review, the researcher encounters a literature review.



This review focuses on prior scholarly works that have explored novels, feminist ideologies and patriarchal constructs.

## Chapter 2

### Literature Review

#### Overview

In the literature review chapter, the researcher scrutinizes previously published academic discourses pertinent to novels, feminist theory, and patriarchal frameworks. A meticulous examination of extant scholarly treatises aims to furnish an intellectual foundation, thus enriching the context for the research topic we consider vital. This examination creates a pivotal junction between existing knowledge and the innovative arguments this study intends to construct.

#### Existing Studies on the Selected Works

Malhotra (2019) discusses the female issues in his research work tracing the forms of violence included in patriarchal society in a study of *the Pakistani bride* by Bapsi Sidhwa where he defines that Sidhwa has depicted the territory of men in the patriarchal Pakistani culture. She has also described a true story of a girl who was sold in a game of barrage in the distant and reported area of Kohistan. Throughout the tooth story, we are shown the brutality of that hub how female bodies are exploited and how she struggles to leave the area and has nothing except a blanket that is used to hide from the severe cold days. Zaitoon runs from his house because of the cruel attitude of her husband, who treats her like his property and behaves in a very cruel way.

Ross (1991) expresses that the notion of master and this leaves, highly covered in our society and women are considered slaves of the bed and men are considered masters. In the vision of man where he says that we are the masters, we have the right to do anything, we are liberal, we are free, and we are the head who holds society with our visions. The bride captures a new wave of light that presented the woman; it gives a new picture of Pakistani society and Pakistani culture. It debates dominating society and the element of hope which is hidden in the woman that is flourished. Fazio Afzal says that this novel is a challenge to the patriarchal culture and values of Indian Pakistani society.



According to Marwah Anne, Frislid Sveinhaug, the Pakistani bride emphasises the pain of women and their sense of helplessness in the patriarchal culture that is shown. The female body and the patriarchal society's perception of control are directly related to misery. Despite the female heroine of the book rebelling against patriarchy, Bill control still controls the advertisement. The civilization in which the book is situated remains unchanged, but it does not convey to the reader that this is the necessary reality. Cracking The narrative concentrates on the shattered pieces of the patriarchal society, the pieces that may be exploited for self-realization or the greater good. India is more hopeful than the Pakistani bride. Even if some of them are punished for their independence, the book nonetheless allows these women to speak and be heard towards the conclusion of the narrative. Zaitoon, the protocol character, does her unusual acts of rebellion or challenge to the patriarchy. According to Harisree HG (2019), women are bound to live inside patriarchal frameworks of values since they come from various eras and civilizations. The patriarchy confers authority on women that transcends time, place, and cultural boundaries. It has always been tough for women in Pakistan to advance and fight for their rights due to the exploitative treatment they get from their employers.

The Pakistani Bride includes multiple narratives, particularly in the beginning, which might be perceived as being somewhat fragmented. According to Muhammad Nawaz (2019), the book can be broadly split into four segments. The Punjabi woman who lost her family during the violence of the partition of British India into India and Pakistan is adopted by the Kohistani tribal Qasim as a result of his marriage and the loss of his family. As she assumes the role of the novel's protagonist, the second half portrays the two childhoods. The Zaitoon marriage in the tribal territory is the subject of the third section. It introduces Carol, an American lady touring the nation with her Pakistani husband, as a side protagonist. In the fourth and last chapter of the book, Zaitoon flees from her abusive husband and his house; she is pursued into the mountains but is ultimately spared.

According to Fauzia Syiva (2019), operations and policies that lead to injustices and inequalities affect women in Afghanistan. At every level of Afghanistan's patriarchal culture, Afghan women struggle. The main reason for Afghan women's rights being violated is the dominance of men, which has the effect of making Afghan women feel inferior. The author of



the study draws on Kate Millet's radical feminism to discuss the difficulties Afghan women face in advancing in their academic careers. According to her, female characters who deal with resolving their unfair circumstances, like Zeba, Gulnaz, and others, started to develop the self-consciousness to demand equal rights in decision-making, to retrain their resistance to being ruled by men, and to obtain their fundamental rights, like the right to education, the right of speech, and the right to work and to make money. The radical feminism in literature made clear that women's attempts to defend their rights constitute support for gender inequality and the dearth of chances for women.

Salman Muhammad describes the brutality against women in the Afghan patriarchal system, although Hamid and Mahmoud Sakib also provide accounts. They were outraged by the abuse against women in Afghan patriarchal culture as shown in Nadia Hashmi's book *A House Without Windows*. The goal is to identify the causes of violence against women in a patriarchal culture like that of Afghanistan. Sylvia Walby's understanding of violence has been used as a theoretical foundation for the in-depth text study. The study found that the harmony and understanding between Afghan households were destroyed by violence against women. They contend that in order for women to actively participate to the advancement of society, they should be provided with an environment that values freedom together with their legal rights and protection from exploitation and abuse.

Rashid Tuba (2022) describes *House without Windows* she says that the writer portrayed the Afghan woman's life as a prisoner in their bodies as they were suffering their stories inside the prison. The article focuses on the semiotic relationship between the special prison and the temporal prison in that women live under the patriarchy. The author argues that the prisoners become a space of both liberation and residence for the woman who seeks freedom from the operation of patriarchy. It also examines the silence that is maintained by Afghan woman outside of the prisons as a mean of their control over their voices which becomes an active form of resistance the author uses gyno-criticism to analyze the novel and understand how female writer is fighting against the patriarchal discourse and this approach emphasized the importance of studying women's writing and experiences of the challenge that is dominant discourse and creates the new meaning the article contributes to the growing body of literature



on the gender-based violence and the woman of Afghanistan experiences the complex ways in which women resist in a patriarchal society and seeks liberation is quite complex and challenging.

According to Muhammad and Ahmad (2022), third-world women have often been portrayed in Western literature as ignorant, meek, and lacking in individuality. The West tends to see them as being primitive, yet the globe is open to questioning feminist practices to improve the precise and true representation of the third-world woman. *The House without Windows* is an example of how Western authors expertly presented the urgent challenges facing each woman in their society in their different forms, thus destroying the false stereotypical picture that was constructed.

This is because this essay tries to analyse the notable contrasts between the usual Western portrayal of the third-world women and how they are depicted as weak and in need of assistance in the mainstream and Western discourse and their representation by non-western authors. It also looks at how the female characters deal with the challenges of their life and overcomes obstacles without fear while navigating the patriarchal and non-Western cultural norms. To understand the disparity between the global north and the south and to address how third-world women are portrayed, the feminist theory provides a great framework. The striking image of a powerful woman explores and considers the traditional perception of women in the developing world as well as the universalization of global sisterhood.

### **Feminism and Patriarchy in South Asian Literature**

The themes of feminism and patriarchy are profoundly pervasive across South Asian literature, acting as a poignant lens through which societal norms, gender roles, and systemic inequalities are scrutinized. Although the South Asian context offers a diverse landscape, this review strictly concentrates on Pakistan, where literature has often functioned as a medium for social commentary. This paper critically examines the extant scholarship on feminism and patriarchy within the specific realm of Pakistani literature. It seeks to explore the dualistic narratives around women's experiences and the ingrained patriarchal systems that often bind them. Pakistani literature offers a fertile ground to explore the concept of patriarchy and feminism within its socio-political and cultural contexts.





The historical complexities related to the partition, religious orthodoxy, and state politics have often been mirrored through literary works. While the patriarchal roots are deeply entrenched in cultural, social, and religious fabrics, the emergence of feminist literature in Pakistan has increasingly questioned these systems. However, scholarly work within this domain has often found itself entangled between the traditional cultural narratives and the emerging voices for women's rights. One of the first debates in existing literature addresses the definitions of 'feminism' and 'patriarchy' within the Pakistani context. Unlike Western feminism, Pakistani feminist literature often has to navigate religious dogmas and cultural norms, making it a unique area of study. While patriarchy is generally understood as a system that perpetuates male dominance, it is complicated by factors like class, religion, and ethnicity in Pakistan.

Another focal point of scholarship lies in the assessment of whether literature serves to subvert or conform to traditional patriarchal ideologies. Researchers are divided on the issue, with some arguing that the nuanced character development and plotlines can empower women, while others claim that certain narratives only serve to entrench existing stereotypes. A significant body of work discusses literature as a form of resistance against patriarchal systems. This line of argument posits that the textual world offers an alternative reality where women can explore their identities, experiences, and agency, often in opposition to patriarchal norms. Recent scholarly discussions have included an intersectional approach to understanding feminism and patriarchy in Pakistani literature. This approach considers how other forms of social stratification, like class and religion, intersect with gender to create a complex web of oppression or privilege.

The scholarship often employs various theoretical frameworks to dissect feminism and patriarchy in Pakistani literature. Post-colonialism, Islamic feminism, and critical gender studies are among the frequently used lenses. Each provides a unique understanding of how literature can either challenge or perpetuate systemic issues. One recurring criticism of the existing literature is its limited scope, often restricted to elite, urban experiences while overlooking rural perspectives. Additionally, there is a scholarly tendency to excessively compare Pakistani feminism with its Western counterpart, without considering its unique socio-cultural attributes.



The themes of feminism and patriarchy within Pakistani literature offer an invaluable resource for understanding the complex relationships between gender, power, and society. Although this area of study is gradually expanding, there remains a considerable gap in representing diverse perspectives, especially those from marginalized communities. Future research should aim to broaden the scope and delve into the nuanced experiences of various social groups to provide a more comprehensive understanding. By critically evaluating the prevailing themes and debates, this review highlights the need for more interdisciplinary and inclusive research to enrich the academic discourse on feminism and patriarchy in Pakistani literature.

Afzal, Pakri and Abdullah (2021) venture into an interdisciplinary approach, combining literature with sociology to investigate whether women's empowerment poses a threat to the traditional patriarchal system in Pakistan. Focusing on the Aurat March 2020, a prominent women's rights protest, and the narrative of Bina Shah's novel "Before She Sleeps," they argue that the rising feminist consciousness in Pakistan is challenging patriarchal norms. They introduce the concept of the "Thucydides' Trap," generally used in geopolitical contexts, to frame the tension between the rising power (women's empowerment) and the existing dominant power (patriarchy). Their study highlighted that this growing feminist wave is indeed threatening to disrupt patriarchal stability. However, they also point out the multidimensional nature of patriarchy in Pakistan—rooted in cultural, social, and religious practices—that does not easily allow a complete overthrow of the system. Instead, the new wave of feminism is triggering a restructuring of patriarchy, allowing certain concessions but maintaining overall control. This study contributes to the field by marrying literature with activism to show how literary narratives can reflect, and possibly influence, real-world events.

Yunis Hashim and Anderson (2018) present a comprehensive study on the enablers and constraints facing female entrepreneurship in the Khyber Pukhtunkhawa region of Pakistan, employing both institutional and feminist lenses. Unlike many previous works that only focus on constraints, this study equally highlights the enablers, providing a balanced perspective. They delve into the systemic and cultural hurdles like lack of access to finance, social restrictions, and the absence of female role models while also acknowledging the resilience and



strategies employed by women to overcome these obstacles. The findings of their research add complexity to the narrative of women's roles in Pakistan, moving beyond the victim-agency dichotomy. They argue that the intersection of institutional and feminist perspectives helps understand the larger structural challenges and micro-level mechanisms that both restrain and facilitate women's economic participation. This study is particularly important for policy implications and encourages the adaptation of more gender-sensitive policies that could genuinely contribute to sustainable development.

Chaudary (2013) conducted a research study in the context of feminism and patriarchy in Pakistani literature. Focused on the depiction of female characters in novels by Pakistani women writers who utilize English as their medium, the research approaches the topic through a feminist lens. Chaudary (2013) analyzed difficulties of female identity and constraints imposed by a patriarchal society. The study revealed that women characters are generally caught in a struggle to assert their individuality, separate from the roles dictated by patriarchal norms. Significantly, the study posits that these novels act as smaller representations of broader feminist struggles happening in Pakistan. It offers a cultural critique by exposing entrenched gender biases that are often overlooked. The dissertation advances the conversation by bringing to the fore narratives that are typically marginalized or ignored. Given the cultural and social inhibitions surrounding discussions on feminism in Pakistan, this work serves as reference point for understanding influence of literature as a catalyst for social change in a patriarchal setting like Pakistan.

Rosida and Soraya (2017) employed feminist literary criticism to dissect gender relations in the novel *Willow Trees Don't Weep* by Fadia Faqir. Although it is crucial to underline that Fadia Faqir is not a Pakistani writer. The study provides relevant insights for scholars interested in South Asian literature, including that from Pakistan. Rosida and Soraya (2017) scrutinized relationship of gender roles in a narrative that reflects a socio-cultural environment akin to South Asia. They note that characters in novel embody traditional gender roles which are undergirded by prevailing patriarchal norms. Additionally, the study identifies points in the novel where these traditional roles are questioned or overturned, thereby providing moments that challenge patriarchy. While the research does not focus directly on Pakistani literature, it



contributes to the broader understanding of South Asian literature in its treatment of feminist and patriarchal themes. The study offers a comparative lens for those examining how Pakistani literature confronts similar issues and make it an important work for scholars interested in regional literature grapples such themes.

Hussain and Hussain (2021) explored the representation of postcolonial feminism in Pakistani literature through the novel *Black Bird in a White Cage*. The authors dissect how the book deals with aspects of females experience in a postcolonial and patriarchal landscape. Hussain and Hussain (2021) argue that the novel serves as illustration of how legacies of colonialism and patriarchal traditions continue to influence feminist agendas in Pakistan. The paper highlights that protagonist, although limited by patriarchal structures, also demonstrates moments of agency and resistance. These clarifications indicate the complicated nature of feminist struggles within postcolonial settings. Hussain and Hussain's (2021) research contributes significantly to the evolving discourse on feminism and patriarchy in Pakistani literature. Their work, being a relatively recent contribution, ensures that the academic discussion on these critical issues remains current and continues to evolve.

Deeba & Usman (2019) scrutinize women's liberty through the fiction of Pakistani writer Bano Qudsia. They employ feminist theory as a lens. Herein lies the salience of their work. A nuanced evaluation of female characters in Qudsia's literary universe reveals a challenging landscape. These characters grapple with a panoply of social, psychological, and cultural factors. Each aspect limits or shapes their agency. This research serves a dual purpose. Initially, it enriches feminist critique within Pakistan by focusing on an indigenous writer. Concurrently, it manifests as a scaffold for scholars interested in extending the dialogue on native authorship and its function in advancing feminist thought. Astonishingly, the work transcends mere academic contribution. It prompts a reevaluation of local literary canons for their capacity to mirror and critique societal norms. The research, therefore, acquires heightened relevance.

Sachdev's (2020) investigation serves as an edifying narrative. This scholar chooses two works of literature, 'The Pakistani Bride' and 'Water,' to dissect and critique. Sachdev unravels how the characters, particularly women, find themselves ensnared by ingrained patriarchal constructs. Their lives are ostensibly dictated by external powers, with marriage and familial



structures often serving as instruments of subjugation. As opposed to merely highlighting women's agency or lack thereof, Sachdev presents a holistic canvas. Here, the systemic attributes of patriarchal structures stand fully exposed. Such an orientation magnifies the urgency to scrutinize how literature not only mirrors but also perpetuates these harmful norms. Ergo, the study serves as an imperative call. It seeks to galvanize a nuanced engagement with literature, for the purpose of dismantling archaic, gender-biased paradigms.

Hussain and Ali (2021) analyzed a poetic collection by Rupi Kaur, "*Home Body*." Though not a Pakistani author, Kaur's South Asian heritage renders her work relevant for a pan-South Asian feminist discourse. The authors concentrate on the psychological dimensions of patriarchal subjugation. Through meticulous analysis, they discern that Kaur's work serves as an affecting social commentary. This endeavor is particularly noteworthy for its focus on the emotional landscape of women. While a copious amount of existing studies fixate on overt, palpable manifestations of patriarchal norms, Hussain and Ali opt for a subtle yet incisive approach. They succeed in unearthing the emotional scars left by such norms. By elucidating this underexamined realm, the study contributes new shades of meaning to ongoing debates around feminism and patriarchy in South Asian literature. Thus, the scholarship finds itself not merely as an addendum but as a pivotal component in the evolving terrain of academic discourse.

Zaidi, Sahibzada and Farooq (2022) examined the subversion of pre-established gender roles in Pakistani society. Their lens of inquiry falls upon three diverse literary works: *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, *Butterfly Season*, and *Stained*. Methodically, they discern instances where female characters transgress societal norms dictated by entrenched patriarchy. The study discloses a multiplicity of resistance strategies. These may include, among other modalities, nuanced relational dynamics, personal ambition, or the repudiation of traditional familial structures. Herein emerges a pertinent revelation. The texts do not merely serve as passive reflectors of societal norms; they become active participants in societal change. Rather than embodying mere repositories of prevailing mores, they offer counter-narratives. These challenge the stagnant waters of patriarchal thought, thereby serving as a conduit for transformation. In doing so, this scholarly endeavor achieves more than mere literary criticism. Indeed, it stands as a polemical engagement with static cultural values.





Yasmeen and Ahmad (2022) explored the intersectionality of subalternism, women, and patriarchy within the paradigm of Mohsin Hamid's *Exit West*. Employing a postcolonial lens, the authors shed light on the labyrinthine relationship between marginality and female subjugation. More precisely, the work examines how systemic patriarchy becomes further exacerbated when intersecting with subaltern positions. Their research remarkably moves beyond simple attributions of victimhood to women characters. They demonstrate how the narrative terrain of *Exit West* serves as a cauldron for more complex, ambivalent dynamics. For instance, the dichotomy of oppressor and oppressed becomes muddled, showing that even within the labyrinth of patriarchy, shades of agency and resistance are perceptible. Thus, in an academic realm rife with dichotomous portrayals, Yasmeen and Ahmad succeed in introducing gradations. This elevation of discourse extends its significance far beyond literary criticism; it becomes a manifesto for recognizing the multifaceted experiences of women in South Asian, particularly Pakistani, contexts.

#### Gayatri Spivak's Perspective on Feminism and Patriarchy

Spivak (1985) "Can the Subaltern Speak?" addresses the conundrum of voice and representation for the marginalized. Her critical examination probes the ways in which power structures silence subaltern voices, particularly focusing on women in postcolonial settings. Unraveling the stratified layers of patriarchal and colonial legacies, Spivak foregrounds the absence of authentic representation for these muted groups. The pivotal claim she advances holds that subaltern women lack the platform to articulate their experiences or shape their narratives within male-dominated discourses. Moreover, the essay doesn't merely delineate this voicelessness but also critically interrogates the ethical and theoretical implications that emanate from it. Spivak's work can be seen as groundbreaking; it inaugurated a profound, scholarly reconsideration of how feminist theories interact with and often exist within larger structures of domination. Within her writing, Spivak dismantles commonly held paradigms in feminist thought, problematizing generalized claims about universal female experience.

Spivak (1996) "Diasporas Old and New," Spivak turns her analytical gaze toward the experiences of women within transnational diasporas. This meticulous investigation, appearing in *Textual Practice*, reveals that migration, too, bears the weight of patriarchal structures.



Spivak dissects how women's roles and identities evolve in response to the challenges and opportunities that transnational environments provide. Her work identifies not just a shifting geographical context but an ideological one as well; one in which patriarchal systems adjust to retain power. The notion of "old and new" diasporas serves as an investigative lens, enabling a complex scrutiny of women's shifting roles and identities. This challenges the overly simplistic binaries often employed in discussions surrounding migration, feminism, and patriarchy. The paper stands as a decisive contribution to a nuanced understanding of the complexities women face within the disorienting flux of transnational movement.

Spivak (1996) "The Spivak Reader" offers a comprehensive survey of her scholarly oeuvre. Compiled and released by Psychology Press, the reader traverses multiple terrains—from deconstruction to Marxism, to feminism, and postcolonial studies. The unique aspect lies in the harmonization of these various strands of thought. Spivak's reader cohesively outlines how patriarchy intersects with other systems of oppression. It provides an aggregate of her thoughts, thereby allowing for an overarching critique that captures the multifarious nature of systemic subjugation. In essence, this compilation elucidates how Spivak's feminist philosophy challenges the constraints of parochial approaches to gender-based discrimination. It opens up new avenues for feminist scholarship, particularly in highlighting how multiple systems of oppression operate in concert.

Spivak (2012) in her work "French Feminism in an International Frame" scrutinizes the tenets of French feminism, illuminating its limitations and its potential when placed in a global context. The study, part of a collection published by Routledge, interrogates whether Western feminist paradigms, specifically those from France, possess relevance for issues beyond their geopolitical boundaries. Spivak maintains that Western feminisms, although potent in their socio-political milieu, frequently falter in encapsulating the complexities that women from different geographical and cultural terrains experience. This scrutiny ushers in a new dimension into feminist discourse; it turns the gaze towards the inherently patriarchal assumptions even within well-meaning feminist frameworks. The work becomes crucial in understanding how feminism itself can unwittingly sustain vestiges of patriarchy by adhering to Western-centric viewpoints.



Spivak (2012) in her work “A Literary Representation of the Subaltern: A Woman's Text from the Third World” presents critique of how subaltern women are represented in Third World literature. Her examination is meticulous, conveys the dilemma faced by subaltern females: they seldom have agency in the narrative structures that endeavor to represent them. While illuminating, the study asserts that these literary endeavors often uphold patriarchal norms. Yet, the work stands apart in not merely decrying this state of affairs. Instead, it exhorts scholars to recognize that subaltern women can, in the course of their struggles, produce narratives that question, rather than conform to, traditional roles dictated by male-dominated cultures. By dissecting the patriarchal underpinnings in representations of subaltern women, Spivak complicates the feminist dialogue concerning voice and agency.

Spivak (2012) in her work “Subaltern Studies: Deconstructing Historiography” navigates the intricate labyrinth of historiography through the lens of subaltern studies. Spivak casts a discerning eye on how history, often penned by the victors, propagates patriarchal ideals. Her quest transcends a simplistic demand for inclusivity. Rather, it beckons a comprehensive deconstruction of how history gets written, insisting that the subaltern must be given agency, not just representation. The study offers a brilliant critique, arguing that patriarchal imprints on historiography lead to its monolithic structures. This paper, thus, marks another leap in Spivak’s ever-evolving feminist critique, urging readers to question even the reliability of history when it comes to the representation of women and, by extension, the patriarchal systems it frequently bolsters.

Spivak (2013) in her work “French Feminism Revisited: Ethics and Politic” grapples with French feminism anew. A critique emerges, this time focusing not just on theory but also on ethical imperatives and political nuances. The work reveals a fascinating dichotomy: while advocating ethical agendas, French feminism frequently elides issues of imperialism, inadvertently sustaining patriarchal agendas. Furthermore, the politics of French feminism remain largely Eurocentric. Hence, Spivak dissects the inadvertent reinforcement of patriarchal tenets in French feminism. She manages to unravel how even ostensibly emancipatory frameworks might perpetuate age-old gender inequities. For a wider scholarly audience, her



paper wields analytical prowess. It compels the academe to recognize the entanglement of ethics, politics, and patriarchy within feminist dialogues.

Spivak (2014) in her work "Feminism and Deconstruction, Again: Negotiations" revisits the intersection of feminism with deconstructionist theory. The reiteration of "Again" in the title speaks volumes, signaling her relentless commitment to evaluating the constant changes in theoretical frameworks. Spivak's elucidation has gravitas; it challenges the linearity often ascribed to feminist progress. She reckons that feminism and deconstruction need incessant recalibration. Notably, Spivak indicates how the very language of feminism can often encapsulate patriarchal subtexts, underscoring the need for constant negotiation. Scholars and theorists enamored by feminist discourse will find Spivak's focus on linguistic deconstruction exceedingly illuminating. The work thus catalyzes thought-provoking discussion on the intersectionality of language, feminism, and patriarchal systems.

Chowdhury and Ahmad (2023) work "The Continued Silencing of Gayatri Spivak's Subaltern" deals the treatment of Spivak's seminal concept of the "subaltern" within postcolonial feminism, primarily in the South Asian context. The pair go beyond mere admiration or critique of Spivak's work. They unearth the paradoxical silencing of her theories in discourse concerning the subaltern in postcolonial feminist studies. Interestingly, the authors argue that Spivak's concepts, despite their transformative potential, often fall prey to selective interpretation and commodification. In the final analysis, this limits their radicalism and serves to sustain patriarchal power structures. For scholars and critics who are already steeped in postcolonial feminist discourse, this meta-analysis forces a reckoning with the complexities and ironies of academic appropriation.

### Summary

In summation, the Literature Review chapter examined prior academic investigations that grapple with feminism, novels and patriarchal systems. It aspired to serve as a crucial bridge, spanning the chasm between established scholarship and the unique perspectives this research venture intends to introduce. Following the literature review, the next is chapter, referred to as "Methodology," elucidates the procedural aspects and research techniques employed in this academic investigation.



## Chapter 3

### Research Methodology

#### Overview

To begin with the chapter "Methodology," readers encounters detailed elaboration on the theoretical perspectives serving as the backbone of this scholarly exploration. In addition, the chapter elaborates on the employment of qualitative research methodology for this academic work. It delineates both the modes employed for gathering data and the analytical methods selected for deciphering these data. With precise clarity, this chapter aims to elucidate the whole methodologies driving the investigative process.

#### Theoretical Framework

Gayatri Spivak is most known for her overtly political use of contemporary, social, and important ideas to examine the effects of colonialism on how we read and think about other cultures and literature. The article "Can the Subaltern Speak?" (1985) by Gayatri Spivak describes how Western civilizations study other cultures. She raises the issue of sexual and gender disparities in the workplace. The critics of the well-known theory of Gayatri Spivak are silence subalterns, which can present a challenge to any reading of the protagonist's woman characters. According to Spivak, subalterns are people from third-world countries who are unable to speak up because they are divided by gender, cost, region, religion, and other narratives and these divisions prevent them from standing up in unity. The goal of this research is to go into the issue of "Can the Subaltern Speak?" Within the context of the biographies of Bapsi Sidhwa's *The Pakistani Bride*, and Nadia Hashmi's *House Without Windows*. She argues that the desire to keep the subject of the West specifically in mind when writing the history of the third World, which is primarily polluted, prejudices Western intellectuals.

According to her, the entire text is diagnosed with the exact lines that provide the idea of objective location, discrimination, insulting, deriving, marginalising women's positions, heartless authoritative kindle manipulative pictures of men, and the immense domination in the Third World. Spivak's (2013) elucidation on the ethical and political dimensions of French feminism furnishes a lens for discerning how feminist paradigms can inadvertently reinforce patriarchal norms. This framework directs scholarly focus toward how liberating discourses,





such as feminism, might be enmeshed in a complex tangle with patriarchal structures. The acumen of Spivak's analysis lies in its capacity to question feminist underpinnings critically. Through this lens, researchers and scholars can interrogate whether emancipatory narratives genuinely destabilize male-dominated paradigms or paradoxically perpetuate them.

Similarly, Spivak's (2014) explored the nexus of feminism and deconstruction invites meticulous scrutiny of language's role in reinforcing or undermining patriarchal constructs. Beyond merely serving as a set of concepts or arguments, this framework prompts a surgical deconstruction of vernacular, terminology, and linguistic patterns. Hence, the toolset provided by Spivak enables a critical evaluation of how language in academic discourse, policy, or social systems may be imbued with patriarchal subtexts, even when clothed in feminist phraseology. The work by Chowdhury and Ahmad (2023), which critiques the selective deployment and silencing of Spivak's notion of the subaltern, further refines this theoretical apparatus. It adds an additional layer that urges scholars to reflect upon the voices that are omitted, marginalized, or silenced within feminist scholarship itself. This facet compels scholars to engage with their own academic milieu critically, thereby considering the possibility that the academic realm may perpetuate patriarchal structures under the guise of postcolonial feminist critique. Consequently, Spivak's contributions extend beyond textual analysis to serve as a meta-framework for critiquing the very institutional settings that generate and disseminate feminist theories.

### Methodology

The methodology used in this research work is qualitative in which textual analysis of the selected texts of the selected Asian novels *The Pakistani Bride* by Bapsi Sidhwa and *House Without Windows* by Nadia Hashmi is made. The text related to patriarchal trends and oppression, and suppression are highlighted and examined. Qualitative research method, as elucidated by Hammarberg, Kirkman, and de Lacey (2016), is an approach to inquiry that prioritizes the exploration of subjective dimensions in terms of human experiences and phenomena. It entails a systematic process of data collection and analysis, uses methods such as in-depth interviews, focus groups, or content analysis to extract contextually embedded insights. Unlike quantitative research, qualitative research does not seek to quantify or generalize findings; rather, it strives to



comprehend underlying meanings, motivations, and social constructs that influence individuals' behaviors and perspectives. This method proves especially apt when researchers aim to deal the depth of human phenomena and provide lens through which to investigate issues, unveil concealed perspectives and cultivate holistic understandings of various phenomena.

### Data Collection

This study focuses on the qualitative analysis of the selected works. In this research first of all the researcher reads the selected novels *The Pakistani Bride* by Bapsi Sidhwa and *House Without Windows* by Nadia Hashmi and then analyzes how effectively the theory was employed in these works. We will also illustrate the text with the help of authors' quotations then the researcher selects some quotes from the text that describe the attitudes, behaviour, action ideas and indirections opinions about the women and those textual lines represent the characters with the help of thought analysis and the researcher also depict the picture of the society of that time, that culture, values and customs. This study presents a qualitative analysis of the selected novels to highlight those aspects which are not only dominant in Asia but also in various other regions of the world. The oppression of women in such a male society has been the main theme of many literary studies so this treatment is being analyzed by applying the qualitative analysis of Spivak on the selected works

### Summary

The methodology chapter provided an exhaustive knowledge regarding the theoretical framework, qualitative research method, data collection techniques and interpretative analytics adopted. For the initiated and uninitiated alike, this chapter presents itself as a navigational guide through the academic scrutiny. Next in this sequence, the upcoming chapter, named "Data Analysis," aims to dissect the textual essence of the novels under study. This dissection, conducted through the lens of feminist and patriarchal frameworks, attempts to unveil new vistas in these respective paradigms.

### References

Ahmad, I. (2013). Conquered Land: A Feministic Reading of Bapsi Sidhwa's *The Pakistani Bride*. *The Criterion*, 4.



- Afzal, M. H., Pakri, M. R. M., & Abdullah, N. F. L. (2021). Is Women's Empowerment a Thucydides' Trap for Patriarchy in Pakistan? The Aurat (Woman) March-2020 and Bina Shah's Before She Sleeps. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 22(9), 111-127.
- Brunell, L. and Burkett, Elinor (2023, February 22). *Feminism Encyclopedia Britannica*.
- Coward, R. (2022). *Patriarchal precedents: Sexuality and social relations*. Taylor & Francis.
- Chowdhury, R., & Ahmad, F. (2023). 3 The Continued Silencing of Gayatri Spivak's Subaltern. *Postcolonial Feminism in Management and Organization Studies: Critical Perspectives from India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh*.
- Checkland, K. (2023). *Books: Hags: the Demonisation of Middle-Aged Women: Patriarchy, Power, and Older Women*.
- Chaudary, F. (2013). *Hiding and seeking identity: The female figure in the novels of Pakistani Female writers in English: A feminist approach* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Huddersfield).
- Deeba, F., & Usman, A. (2019). Rediscovering the Discourse on Women's Freedom: A Feminist Exploration of Bano Qudsia's Fiction. *Journal of Political Studies*, 26(2), 137-147.
- Fauzia, N. S., & Rahayu, A. C. (2019). Women's Struggle against Patriarchy: An Analysis of Radical Feminism Through Nadia Hashimi's *A House Without Windows*. *Anaphora: Journal of Language, Literary, and Cultural Studies*, 2(1), 1-9.
- Facio, A. (2013). What is patriarchy. Translated from the Spanish by Michael Solis, 1-5.
- Griffiths, M. (2018). For speaking against silence: Spivak's subaltern ethics in the field. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 43(2), 299-311.
- Gruenbaum, E., Earp, B. D., & Shweder, R. A. (2023). Reconsidering the role of patriarchy in upholding female genital modifications: analysis of contemporary and pre-industrial societies. *International Journal of Impotence Research*, 35(3), 202-211.
- Hashimi, N., Delawari, A., & Nezami, S. (2016). *A house without windows*. William Morrow.
- Hussain, S., & Ali, A. (2021). Envisioning the Psychologically Subjugated Women: The Feminist Study of Rupi Kaur's *Home Body*. *Language in India*, 21(12), 210-221.
- Hussain, S., & Hussain, S. (2021). Representation of Postcolonial Feminism in Noonari's *Black Bird in a White Cage*. *ELITE JOURNAL*, 3(2), 105-116.



- Hammarberg, K., Kirkman, M., & de Lacey, S. (2016). Qualitative research methods: when to use them and how to judge them. *Human reproduction*, 31(3), 498-501.
- Mahmood, T (2018). Pakistan and feminism. *Dailytimes* 1.
- Malhotra, S. (2019). Tracing The Forms of Violence Against Gender in Patriarchal Society: A Study of Bapsi Sidhwa's *The Pakistani Bride*. *IJCIRAS*, 2(1), 75-76.
- Marwah, A. F.S. (2008). When I raised my head again: feminism and the female body in Bapsi Sidw's novels *The Pakistani bride* and *cracking India* (Master thesis).
- Mohammed, D., & Rasheed, L. A. *AWEJ-tls.org*.
- Mohammed, R. J., & Rasheed, L. A. (2022). A Non-Western Representation of the Third World Women in Nadia Hashimi's *A House without Windows*.
- Rakow, L. F. (2022). Feminist approaches to popular culture: Giving patriarchy its due. In *Feminist Critiques of Popular Culture* (pp. 19-41). Routledge.
- Rasheed, T. (2022). Women in Afghanistan: The Ambivalence of the Prison in Nadia Hashimi's *A House without Windows*. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 24(6), 17.
- Rosida, I., & Soraya, A. (2017). Gender Relation in *Willow Trees Don't Weep* Novel (2014) by Fadia Faqir: A Feminist Literary Criticism. *Insaniyat: Journal of Islam and Humanities*, 2(1), 13-28.
- Salman, M., Butt, M. H., & Mahmood, S. (2020). Violence Against Women in Afghan Patriarchal Setup Reflected Through Nadia Hashimi's *A House Without Windows*. *Pakistan Language and Humanities Review*, 4(1), 23-33.
- Sidhwa, B. (2008). *The Pakistani bride*. Milkweed Editions.
- Srivastava, S., & Singh, A. K. (2016). A Study of Female Figure in Bapsi Sidhwa's 'The Pakistani Bride' and Tehmina Durrani's 'My Feudal Lord'. *ANGLISTICUM. Journal of the Association-Institute for English Language and American Studies*, 4, 56-64.
- Spivak, G. C. (1985). Can the subaltern speak?. *journal Wedge*.
- Spivak, G. C. (1996). *Diasporas old and new: Women in the transnational world*. *Textual practice*, 10(2), 245-269.
- Spivak, G. C. (1996). *The spivak reader: selected works of Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak*. Psychology Press.



- Spivak, G. C. (2012). French feminism in an international frame. In *In other worlds* (pp. 184-211). Routledge.
- Spivak, G. C. (2012). A Literary Representation of the Subaltern: A Woman's Text from the Third World I. In *In Other Worlds* (pp. 332-370). Routledge.
- Spivak, G. C. (2012). Subaltern studies: Deconstructing historiography. In *In other worlds* (pp. 270-304). Routledge.
- Spivak, G. C. (2013). French feminism revisited: Ethics and politics. In *Feminists theorize the political* (pp. 54-85). Routledge.
- Spivak, G. C. (2014). 3.3 U Feminism and Deconstruction, Again: negotiations. *Critical Theory: A Reader*, 212.
- Sachdev, N. (2020). Women as a victim of patriarchal construct in the pakistani bride and water. *International Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 5(2), 10-22.
- Ullah, S. F., Khan, I. U., & Khan, A. K. (2021). Power and Gender Issues in Sidhwa's *The Pakistani Bride: A Critical Discourse Analysis*. *sjesr*, 4(1), 240-246.
- Yasmeen, T., & Ahmad, I. (2022). Subalternism, Women and Patriarchy: A Postcolonial Approach to Mohsin Hamid's *Exit West*. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 6(4), 555-561.
- Yunis, M. S., Hashim, H., & Anderson, A. R. (2018). Enablers and constraints of female entrepreneurship in Khyber Pukhtunkhawa, Pakistan: Institutional and feminist perspectives. *Sustainability*, 11(1), 27.
- Zaidi, S., Sahibzada, M., & Farooq, S. (2022). Subversion of Pre-Defined Female Gender Roles in Pakistani Society: A Feminist Analysis of the *Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, *Butterfly Season* and *Stained*. *Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 61(1), 1-14.
- Zulfiqar, G. M. (2022). Inequality regimes, patriarchal connectivity, and the elusive right to own land for women in Pakistan. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 177(4), 799-811.